Case 3:18-cr-00577-CRB Document 398 Filed 03/28/24 Page 1 of 3

1 2 3 4 5	Jonathan Matthew Baum (SBN: 303469) Steptoe LLP One Market Street Steuart Tower, Suite 1070 San Francisco, CA 94105 Telephone: (510) 735-4558 jbaum@steptoe.com	Christopher J. Morvillo Celeste L.M. Koeleveld Daniel S. Silver (Admitted Pro Hac Vice) Clifford Chance US LLP 31 West 52nd Street New York, NY 10019 Telephone: (212) 878-3437	
6	Reid H. Weingarten Brian M. Heberlig	christopher.morvillo@cliffordchance.com	
7	Michelle L. Levin Nicholas P. Silverman	Attorneys for Defendant	
8	Drew C. Harris	Michael Richard Lynch	
9	Steptoe LLP		
10	1114 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10036		
11	Telephone: (212) 506-3900		
12			
13	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT		
14	NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA		
15	UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,	Case No.: 3:18-cr-00577-CRB	
16	ONTED STATES OF AMERICA,	Judge: Hon. Charles Breyer	
17	Plaintiff,	DEFENDANT MICHAEL RICHARD LYNCH'S MOTION TO EXCLUDE	
18	VS.	SPECULATIVE AND IMPROPER OPINION TESTIMONY	
19	MICHAEL RICHARD LYNCH and		
20	STEPHEN KEITH CHAMBERLAIN,	Data Maral 28 2024 0.00 am	
21	Defendants.	Date: March 28, 2024, 9:00 a.m. Court: Courtroom 6 – 17 th Floor	
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
20 27			
28			
	DEFENDANT MICHAEL RICHARD LYNCH'S MOTION TO EXCLUDE SPECULATIVE AND IMPROPER		

OPINION TESTIMONY – 3:18-CR-00577-CRB

Late this evening, the government provided the defense with a March 23, 2024 FBI report of its interview of witness Christopher ("Stouffer") Egan, who is expected to begin testifying tomorrow afternoon. The one-page report suggests the government intends to ask Mr. Egan a set of questions requiring him to speculate or provide improper lay opinion testimony about the nature of the relationship between Dr. Lynch and Sushovan Hussain.

Specifically, the report contains the following three statements about the nature of the relationship:

- 1) "EGAN had no reason to think Sushovan Hussain (HUSSAIN) was keeping any matter large or small from Mike Lynch (LYNCH)."
- 2) "EGAN thought there was a complete exchange of information between HUSSAIN and LYNCH with only a limited amount of information that LYNCH would not tell HUSSAIN."
- 3) "EGAN did not think there was anything HUSSAIN would not tell LYNCH."

Rule 602 is clear. A witness may testify about a matter only if he has personal knowledge. See also *United States v. Lopez*, 762 F.3d 852, 863 (9th Cir. 2014) ("Personal knowledge means knowledge produced by the direct involvement of the senses."). Rule 701 permits lay opinion testimony, but only if such testimony is "rationally based on the witness's perception." Fed. R. Evid. 701(a).

Neither rule allows the type of testimony contemplated here. As a fact witness, Mr. Egan can testify as to matters of which he has personal knowledge of facts, including facts that might bear on the jury's understanding of the nature of the relationship between Dr. Lynch and Mr. Hussain. But he is not permitted to speculate or draw unsupportable conclusions, such as stating whether "there was anything HUSSAIN would not tell LYNCH" or whether they would keep "any matter large or small" from each other.

Case 3:18-cr-00577-CRB Document 398 Filed 03/28/24 Page 3 of 3

1	Mr. Egan also cannot offer lay opinion testimony about whether Hussain and Lynch	
2	shared everything with each other, or whether they might ever keep things from one another. Mr.	
3	Egan lived on a different continent from both Lynch and Hussain and only interacted with	
4	Hussain and Lynch in person a few times a year. Therefore, the opinions expressed are not	
5	"rationally based on the witness's perception" and should be excluded. Fed. R. Evid. 701(a).	
6	Additionally, such lay opinion testimony is not "helpful to clearly understanding the witness's	
7	testimony or to determining a fact in issue." Fed. R. Evid. 702(b). Lastly, such speculation	
8	should be excluded because its probative value is substantially outweighed by the risk of unfair	
9	prejudice. Fed. R. Evid. 403.	
10		
11		
12	Dated: March 27, 2024	
13	Respectfully submitted,	
14	By: <u>/s/ Celeste L.M. Koeleveld</u> Christopher J. Morvillo	
15		
16	Christopher J. Morvillo Celeste L.M. Koeleveld	
17	Daniel S. Silver (Admitted Pro Hac Vice)	
18	CLIFFORD CHANCE US LLP	
19	Jonathan Matthew Baum (SBN: 303469)	
20	STEPTOE LLP	
$_{21}$	One Market Street Steuart Tower, Suite 1070	
22	San Francisco, CA 94105 Telephone: (510) 735-4558	
23	jbaum@steptoe.com	
24		
25	Attorneys for Defendant	
26	Michael Richard Lynch	
27		
28		
	.l	